Epitome : International Journal of Multidisciplinary Research
ISSN : 2395-6968

Voices of Diaspora: A Comparative Study of Cultural Dislocation and Identity Negotiation in the Fiction of Caryl Phillips, Monica Ali, and Zadie Smith

Prof. Dr. Vijay Dashrath Misal
Supervisor
Moreshwar College, Bhokardan, Dist. Jalna.

Ambadas Bhagwan Sonwane
Research Scholar

Abstract

In this paper, a comparative analysis of how Caryl Phillips, Monica Ali and Zadie Smith depict cultural dislocation and identity negotiation within British diasporic literature is discussed. Drawing on the novels as primary texts and on secondary sources, such as published criticism, theoretical texts on diaspora and hybridity, and analyses of the novels, this paper contends that the three novelists articulate displacement through three different literary modes. The first novelist, Caryl Phillips articulates displacement as an inherited legacy of history and structure through fragmentation and polyphony. The second novelist, Monica Ali articulates it as a gendered and domestic experience through intimate realism. Zadie Smith on the other hand articulates displacement as an ordinary experience of urban multiculturalism through comic irony and in later works, through literary experiment.

Keywords: *diaspora; cultural dislocation; identity negotiation; hybridity; British fiction; Caryl Phillips; Monica Ali; Zadie Smith*

1. Introduction

Migration has redefined the literature of Britain since the mid-twentieth century, and its creative history now constitutes the very core of modern fiction. The writers Caryl Phillips, Monica Ali, and Zadie Smith each have very different backgrounds of diaspora. Caryl Phillips, born in 1958 in St Kitts and growing up in Leeds, writes out of the centuries-long experience of the Atlantic slave trade. Monica Ali, born in 1967 in Dhaka and growing up in Bolton, writes out of the Bangladeshi community in East London. Zadie Smith, born in 1975 to a Jamaican mother and an English father, writes out of the mixed communities of northwest London. Each asks what it means to be a part of a nation that has also been the source of historical alienation.This paper contrasts the techniques used by these three authors in portraying the theme of cultural displacement and identity negotiation. This research treats the novels themselves as primary sources and draws on secondary data, such as books, journal articles and theoretical essays. The basic thesis of this paper is that the writers have more difference in their technique than in their thematic concerns. Phillips uses historical disintegration, Ali uses domestic realism and consciousness, and Smith uses satire and chance, among others.This discussion starts with a theoretical perspective followed by the methodology, and moves into analysis of each of the three authors separately. Then follows comparative section which addresses issues of form, home, and identity negotiation.

2. Theoretical Framework

Three writers have to be read with a vocabulary that can accommodate within it the notions of history, culture, and subjectivity at once. The vocabulary provided by diaspora studies, hybridity theories, and exile writing provides such a vocabulary.

2.1 Diaspora and Identity as Process

The early concepts of diaspora focused on displacement from an initial point of departure, shared memory of the native land, and the desire to return. Safran's classification crystallized these defining characteristics, whereas Cohen would go on to extend the concept of diaspora to include economic, commercial, and cultural forms and to highlight the sense of community awareness that is built by the displaced population over time. Brah shifts the emphasis away from the native land to diaspora space, a space where both the immigrant population and people who are considered native inhabit, making the process of belonging a negotiation for all concerned. The most useful definition for literary purposes is provided by

Hall when he speaks of cultural identity as "becoming" and not just "being" (225). In his view, cultural identity is produced through history and representation and not something innate. In Said's definition of exile, the emotional aspect becomes important because he starts with the "unhealable rift forced between a human being and a native place" (173).

2.2 Hybridity, Double Consciousness, and the Third Space

Gilroy's The Black Atlantic moves beyond the paradigm of stable national origins to one of transnational paths and analyzes the double consciousness of black Atlantic subjects as a feature of modernity. This reading is appropriate for Phillips because of the migratory nature of his fiction spanning oceans and centuries. The idea of third space and ambivalence of hybridity where the cultural meaning cannot be defined and pure is suggested by Bhabha as a way to analyze the comedy of multiculture in the novels of Smith. The subaltern and its inability to speak are central to the inquiry of Spivak, who asks the question relevant for Ali because of representation of the inner world of a migrant woman by a novelist.

3. Methodology and Scope

This study is qualitative and interpretive and combines close reading of the primary texts with secondary sources. References were found in academic monographs, peer reviewed journals and theoretical works on diaspora, hybridity, multiculturalism and the three authors under analysis. The books analyzed include Crossing the River, The Nature of Blood, and A Distant Shore by Phillips; Brick Lane by Ali; and White Teeth and NW by Smith. The reason for choosing these books lies in their preoccupation with migration and identity and their having garnered considerable scholarly interest. The method used in the research is comparative thematic analysis, wherein common issues like voice, home, memory and agency are analyzed in the works of the three authors. As there has been no fieldwork involved, the validity of conclusions hinges on the reliability of the available scholarly material.

4. Caryl Phillips: Fragmented Histories and Polyphonic Form

All three authors under discussion, Phillips' work is the most ambitious in terms of history. His novels do not submit to having one single narrator or a linear storyline. Enslavement, colonization, and the Holocaust are discussed alongside each other. As Ledent notes, this diversity of voices and rejection of closure is what characterizes Phillips' works,

while Procter examines them within the larger postwar effort by black Britons to reconsider the idea of home.

4.1 Crossing the River and the Chorus of the Dispossessed

Crossing the River (1993) begins with the voice of an African father who laments the loss of the children he sold into slavery and then moves forward through a period of more than two and a half centuries. This period is traced through four narratives: Nash Williams, a freed slave sent from America to Liberia as a missionary; Martha Randolph, an elderly woman travelling west across America; Captain James Hamilton, an English slave-ship captain whose journal records the trade; and Joyce, an Englishwoman in war-time England, and her relationship with Travis, a black American soldier stationed there. Here, dislocation is not just an incident, but a heritage carried from generation to generation and depicted through a chorus of voices. Formally, this work represents the dispersal described. The focus by Gilroy on journeys, crossings, and memory across the Atlantic is a good critical match.

4.2 Exile and Hospitality in The Nature of Blood and A Distant Shore

The Nature of Blood (1997) includes the tales of a survivor of the Holocaust, Jews in Renaissance Venice, Othello, and an Ethiopian Jew in Israel so that exclusion is a theme which repeats itself throughout various histories rather than being the monopoly of one ethnic group. The nature of exclusion is introduced in A Distant Shore (2003) through Dorothy, an old retired teacher, and Solomon, an African asylum seeker, who end up meeting each other in a northern town which fails to give them the welcome that it had promised. Both novels can be interpreted as an examination of the English hospitality which masks its exclusiveness. In both novels, Phillips examines the self through the eyes of the other.

5. Monica Ali: Domestic Space, Gender, and Migrant Agency

In Ali’s account, the scope of diaspora writing shrinks from the broad canvas of history to that of the domestic. The method is rooted in the realistic mode and the singular focus on one consciousness. Upstone locates her work within the context of twenty-first-century British Asian writing that returns to the themes of space and belonging, whereas Ranasinha analyzes the ways South Asian authors in Britain handle cultural translation.

5.1 Brick Lane and the Making of Nazneen

In Brick Lane (2003), Nazneen, an eighteen-year-old girl, marries her much older husband, Chanu, and moves from rural Bangladesh to a council flat in Tower Hamlets. Chanu has dreams of upward social mobility, but they do not materialize and he moves back to Dhaka. On the other hand, Nazneen gains independence as a homeworker and through friendship and an affair with Karim, a young activist. The letters of Nazneen's sister Hasina, written in broken English from Bangladesh, provide the voice of someone who can remind the reader of the life Nazneen could be living. This dislocation is felt through the body and the home; through the language Nazneen is yet to master and through the fatalism that she brings with her. At the same time, this novel puts the community in the post-2001 political context where young men feel drawn to the identity politics in a community. The decision of Nazneen to remain in London without completely breaking ties with her culture is that of identity through negotiation rather than rupture.

5.2 Reception, Representation, and the Politics of Speaking For

The novel's public life demonstrates the way in which diasporic literature becomes a space of contest over who has the right to speak for a community. In the case of the film adaptation of Brick Lane, some members of the Bangladeshi community in London objected that its depiction of Sylhetis was a misrepresentation, so the controversy concerned authorship as much as accuracy. Both Ranasinha's analysis of representation and Perfect's interpretation of the novel within millennial London literatures suggest that Ali's realism encourages readers to consider a single story as representative. The question posed by Spivak is now raised again but in a modified form, as the novel provides Nazneen with interiority despite the different background of the author.

6. Zadie Smith: Hybridity, Multiculture, and Urban Belonging

In Smith's view, diaspora is an aspect of the ordinary world of the city. The writing of Smith sees migration as an aspect of the contemporary English scene. It has a comedic, digressive and skeptical tone about any notion of cultural purity. The essay by Smith "Two Paths for the Novel" further reveals a writer who is thinking explicitly about form, an explanation for the change in her first novel and fourth.

6.1 White Teeth and the Comedy of Hybridity

In White Teeth (2000), the relationship between the English Archie Jones and the Bangladeshi Samad Iqbal is traced through wartime friendship and the development of their respective families in Willesden over many years. For the generation of offspring, Irie, Millat, and Magid, different answers to the question of origins are attempted, ranging from assimilation to religious militancy to scientific rationalism. Squires places White Teeth in relation to multicultural and postcolonial discourse, and Sell reads the novel's emphasis on hybridity as haunted by contingency. In the book's conclusion, where everything happens by luck rather than intention, there is an undermining of the illusion of designing identity. Thus Smith expresses Bhabha's ambivalence in comedic form.

6.2 NW and the Fracturing of Multicultural Optimism

Although NW (2012) begins in the same area of London, it eschews comic plenty for fragmented chapters of different lengths. These characters include Leah, Natalie, who is referred to as Keisha, Felix, and Nathan, who have all grown up in proximity to the Caldwell housing estates, and they have split ways based on their class aspirations and other circumstances. While NW is not so much focused on ethnic background, its concerns center on the difficulties of upward social mobility and self-reinvention. Perfect and Upstone comment that recent multicultural fiction is generally more circumspect regarding the possibilities of diversity than optimistic as regards the end of the 1990s.

7. Comparative Analysis

Set beside each other, the three authors demonstrate that there are multiple ways for diasporic literature to address the problem of dislocation, namely via history, homeland, or the city, while these approaches define the form and politics of literature. The table below evaluates the following aspects of diasporic literature.Table 1 highlights the major differences between the narrative techniques of Phillips, Ali, and Smith. This table consolidates the analysis offered in sections 4 to 6.

Table 1

Comparison of Narrative Approaches to Diasporic Dislocation

Aspect	Caryl Phillips	Monica Ali	Zadie Smith
Narrative mode	Polyphonic and fragmented	Domestic realism, single consciousness	Comic irony; later fragmented form
Dislocation as	Historical inheritance	Gendered, domestic experience	Everyday urban condition
Principal text	Crossing the River	Brick Lane	White Teeth; NW
Critical lens	Gilroy (Black Atlantic)	Spivak (representation)	Bhabha (hybridity)

Source: **Compiled from Ledent; Procter; Ranasinha; Upstone; Perfect; Squires; Sell.**

According to Table 1 above, while the three authors have a shared interest in displacement and belonging, they have diverged in terms of narrative style, portrayal of displacement and the appropriate critical approach. Below are the differences between the three subsections.

7.1 Narrative Form and Voice

Phillips diffuses power among a multitude of voices such that none can be said to narrate the experience of the diaspora. Ali consolidates power in the person of Nazneen, and while Hasina's letters serve as a counterpoint to her story, the upshot is one of emotional intensity over historical breadth. In White Teeth, Smith employs an omniscient narrator who hops between families and generations; in NW she fragments that narrator into voices. The three modes of narration reflect three different conceptions of the diaspora as collective memory, personal struggle, and social fabric.

7.2 Home, Belonging, and Memory

Phillips' idea of home is always displaced as the Atlantic crossing breaks memory, leaving behind no hope of going back, a notion similar to that of Said's rupture. Ali's notion of home is also double, as while Dhaka remains an idealized home, Tower Hamlets becomes a real one for her characters. For Smith, the concept of home is the street, with the issue of

concern not being the origin of people but the way in which they interact in the shared space, a notion similar to that of Brah's diasporic space. For Phillips, memory is important, moderately so for Ali, but much less for Smith.

7.3 Strategies of Identity Negotiation

Identification process is most collectivist in Phillips since individuals represent a larger historical position. Identification process in Ali is most personal because Nazneen modifies the historical expectations through personal choices, and in Smith it is most performance since characters adopt, magnify and drop their identification. The idea of identification as a process proposed by Hall applies to all three cases, although each novelist highlights a certain aspect of the process: Phillips – historical dimension, Ali – gender struggles, and Smith – social improvisation. No one offers a final solution, and this failure is common ground.

8. Conclusion

This comparative analysis demonstrates how Phillips, Ali, and Smith are all preoccupied by the theme of dislocation and belonging yet create their own narrative form of it. Phillips creates a polyphonic story with historical disjunctions and shows how displacement becomes an inherited collective experience for the characters. Ali employs domestic realism and describes the process of one woman gaining autonomy. Finally, Smith uses comedy and further formal disruption to demonstrate that hybridity is a mundane fact and an unstable promise. There are multiple secondary sources suggesting that diasporic identity in these texts is processual, relational, and incomplete. The comparison has proven that the British literature on migration does not fit into any particular framework and that its diversity makes it valuable from a literary point of view. Future work may compare the novels of the discussed authors to works of other contemporary British fiction writers or their adaptations.

Works Cited :

Ali, Monica. *Brick Lane*. Doubleday, 2003.

Bhabha, Homi K. *The Location of Culture*. Routledge, 1994.

Brah, Avtar. *Cartographies of Diaspora: Contesting Identities*. Routledge, 1996.

Cohen, Robin. *Global Diasporas: An Introduction*. 2nd ed., Routledge, 2008.

Gilroy, Paul. *The Black Atlantic: Modernity and Double Consciousness*. Harvard UP, 1993.

Hall, Stuart. "Cultural Identity and Diaspora." *Identity: Community, Culture, Difference*, edited by Jonathan Rutherford, Lawrence & Wishart, 1990, pp. 222–37.

Ledent, Bénédicte. *Caryl Phillips*. Manchester UP, 2002.

Perfect, Michael. *Contemporary Fictions of Multiculturalism: Diversity and the Millennial London Novel*. Palgrave Macmillan, 2014.

Phillips, Caryl. *Crossing the River*. Bloomsbury, 1993.

---. *A Distant Shore*. Secker & Warburg, 2003.

---. *The Nature of Blood*. Faber and Faber, 1997.

Procter, James. *Dwelling Places: Postwar Black British Writing*. Manchester UP, 2003.

Ranasinha, Ruvani. *South Asian Writers in Twentieth-Century Britain: Culture in Translation*. Oxford UP, 2007.

Safran, William. "Diasporas in Modern Societies: Myths of Homeland and Return." *Diaspora: A Journal of Transnational Studies*, vol. 1, no. 1, 1991, pp. 83–99.

Said, Edward W. "Reflections on Exile." *Reflections on Exile and Other Essays*, Harvard UP, 2000, pp. 173–86.

Sell, Jonathan P. A. "Chance and Gesture in Zadie Smith's *White Teeth* and *The Autograph Man*: A Model for Multicultural Identity?" *Journal of Commonwealth Literature*, vol. 41, no. 3, 2006, pp. 27–44.

Smith, Zadie. *NW*. Hamish Hamilton, 2012.

---. "Two Paths for the Novel." *The New York Review of Books*, 20 Nov. 2008.

---. *White Teeth*. Hamish Hamilton, 2000.

Spivak, Gayatri Chakravorty. "Can the Subaltern Speak?" *Marxism and the Interpretation of Culture*, edited by Cary Nelson and Lawrence Grossberg, U of Illinois P, 1988, pp. 271–313.

Squires, Claire. *Zadie Smith's* White Teeth*: A Reader's Guide*. Continuum, 2002.

Upstone, Sara. *British Asian Fiction: Twenty-First-Century Voices*. Manchester UP, 2010.